

Landmark Preservation Board Thursday, December 14, 2023

Meeting Minutes Common Council Chambers

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Julia Marshall called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Cynthia Carter, Kyle Gregory, Julia Marshall, Jeff Romano, Patrona Rowser

Excused: Nicole Fragnito Staff: Kate Auwaerter

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

J. Romano made a motion to approve the minutes of November 2, 2023, as submitted, which was seconded by K. Gregory. The minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Project CA-23-29

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness

Property Address: 438 Columbus Avenue

Project Scope: Interior restoration, new construction, site work

Beth Crawford (Crawford & Stearns Architects) provided a brief historical overview of the house. The current owner of the Stickley House is the Greater Syracuse Land Bank. After restoration/rehabilitation, ownership will be transferred to the Onondaga Historical Association, which will run the house as a guest house, small conference center, and house museum. A caretaker will live onsite in the basement apartment. The exterior alterations of this phase of the project (Phase 2) include the construction of a 460sf addition (the "garden entrance") on the rear of the property that will incorporate an at-grade accessible entrance, a LULA (limited use/limited application) lift providing access to all public floors of the house, an accessible toilet room, and an enclosed egress stair; the restoration/reinstallation of the kitchen stoop on the south side of the house (previously approved by the SLPB); and replacement windows for the second-floor, rear sleeping porch, and replacement of four, multi-pane, fixed-sash windows on the south elevation. B. Crawford noted that the windows on the sleeping porch, which are not original to the house, will be replaced by Marvin wood casement windows that will match the existing 8-light muntin pattern. The four, fixed-sash windows on the south elevation are mid-1990s replacement units in the original frames, which will be replaced with wood (American Chestnut) sash with leaded, divided lights to match the windows in the living room. Interior work in Phase 2 includes the restoration of the main staircase linking the first floor and second floors, and room partition alterations to allow for the introduction of a total of 5 suites on the second and third floors. Site work includes the installation of the concrete backer wall along the perimeter of the driveway and rear hill of the property. The backer wall will eventually be faced in stone.

J. Marshall invited public comment. One person spoke in favor of the project. No one spoke in opposition to the project. At the conclusion of public comment, J. Marshall closed the public hearing.

During board discussion, J. Marshall noted the importance of managing the site's stormwater runoff. B. Crawford stated that Environmental Design & Research is working with the City on the drainage plan for the site. J. Romano asked if there was any evidence of gardens or historic landscape features and plant materials on the site. B. Crawford responded that they had found no evidence of historic hardscape features or plantings. K. Gregory asked for clarification regarding the plan to shut in place several doors on the second floor of the

house. B. Crawford explained that this is necessary for noise reduction and that the doors and framing will remain in place, although the doors will be inoperable.

C. Carter made a motion to approve the application as submitted, which was seconded by K. Gregory. The motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

No Old Business

NEW BUSINESS

V-23-08

Application Type: Variance

Property Address: 216 Lowell Avenue Project Scope: Installation of two spires

Chris White made the presentation on behalf of St. Patrick's Church parish, which is seeking to install two new spires on the church, which were removed in the 1920s. The proposed new spires are prefabricated and made of aluminum. The main spire is proposed to be a three-stage tower consisting of a square "bell-tower" stage with louvered openings at its base, topped by an octagonal stage with louvered openings, and a spire that narrows up to a cross. The base of the spire where it connects to the original brick tower features an ornamental balustrade. The smaller spire consists of a spire alone on a molded base. The height of both spires match closely the heights of the original spires.

In review, the board noted that it was supportive of the parish installing new spires on the church. However, members expressed concern that the style of the proposed main spire was typical of Colonial Revival or Federal period designed churches of New England in contrast to the Gothic Revival style of St. Patrick's church. C. White noted that the original option presented to the parish board was closer to the appearance of the original steeples. However, the parish board was not satisfied with the appearance and selected the three-tier design of the main spire, because they believe it gives the church a more welcoming appearance.

After further discussion, the board agreed that it was in favor of the approval of a variance allowing the church to install new spires on the church. However, the board commented that the proposed design was not characteristic of the Gothic Revival style of the church and recommended that the parish select an architecturally appropriate design for the spires.

DISCUSSION/CORRESPONDENCE

City Planning Commission: Lead Agency Request (Maria Regina Gardens). K. Auwaerter reported that the board was in receipt of a letter from the City Planning Commission (CPC) stating that the CPC intends to act at Lead Agency for the purposes of the environmental review of the Maria Regina/former St. Anthony's Convent and Convent School project. The board indicated it was in favor of the CPC acting as Lead Agency.

National Alliance of Preservation Commissions membership and upcoming training opportunity. K. Auwaerter reminded the board of an upcoming NAPC training and encouraged board members to attend if they were able. She noted that there will be monthly trainings on various topics throughout the year.

<u>ADJOURN</u>

The meeting was adjourned at 9:50 AM upon the motion of C. Carter, seconded by P. Rowser.