



**Landmark Preservation Board**  
**Thursday, November 7, 2019**  
**Meeting Minutes**

Common Council Chambers

**CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair Bob Haley called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

**ROLL CALL**

Members Present: Tom Cantwell, Cynthia Carter, Bob Haley, Dan Leary, Julia Marshall, Jeff Romano

Absent: Don Radke, Joe Saya, Lisa Tonzi

Staff: Kate Auwaerter

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

D. Leary made a motion to approve the minutes of September 19, 2019, which was seconded by C. Carter. The minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

C. Carter made a motion to approve the minutes of October 17, 2019, which was seconded by D. Leary. The minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

**OLD BUSINESS**

CA-19-17 224 Brattle Road. Pat Monan, the applicant, was present. He presented revised drawings for a new portico over the center entrance to his c. 1940 house. The house is considered non-contributing within the preservation district due to its age. The new portico replaces a flat-roofed portico that was installed some time after the house was built. P. Monan explained that the portico had not been installed properly. Water draining back toward the house had caused damage to the wall and to the portico itself, which had deteriorated badly. Just prior to Halloween, a heavy rain caused part of the portico to collapse and so it was removed. The design that P. Monan had originally submitted was for a portico with a convex-shaped copper roof. The revised design features a front-gable roof supported by square, fluted columns that match the detail of the fluted pilasters located at the corners of the front façade of the house. The slope of the gable will match the slope of the gable wall dormers on the second floor of the house. The height of the gable will match the height of the hip-roof bay windows that flank the front entrance.

In discussion, C. Carter noted that the proposed new construction would have no visual impact on the surrounding district. T. Cantwell agreed and added that the new portico appeared to be a compatible addition to the house. D. Leary disagreed stating that the design of the new portico would detract from the overall design of the house and that a better solution would be to construct a low-pitched, flat-roof portico, which would retain the overall balance and focus of the front facade. C. Carter made a motion to approve the application as revised (gable roof), which was seconded by T. Cantwell. The motion passed with a majority of the board. D. Leary voted against the motion and J. Marshall abstained because she was not present for the discussion.

CA-19-20 332 Berkeley Drive. The applicant was not present. The application is for the construction of new steps at 332 Berkeley Drive. The original steps are wood, which have deteriorated beyond repair. The application called for installing new precast-concrete steps with decorative brick risers. The steps will be the same dimension as the current steps. The sidewalls will be concrete to match the foundation walls. K. Auwaerter reminded the Board that it had reviewed the application at its October 17 meeting and had recommended that the applicant eliminate the brick riser detail because the color and texture of the new brick would be hard to match with existing brick of the porch landing. In addition, the brick on the steps is proposed in a running bond pattern, which does not match the bond pattern of the landing. It also recommended that the

steps be stained a dark grey. K. Auwaerter reported that she had discussed the recommendations with the applicant and that he was amenable to all the suggestions. C. Carter made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the new precast-concrete steps will have no decorative brick on the risers or sidewalls and that the concrete will be stained a dark grey. In discussion, it was clarified that the existing brick landing would remain. J. Romano seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

### **NEW BUSINESS**

PR-19-26 318-22 Montgomery Street (former Masonic Temple). Joe Sisko (Commonspace Properties) presented the application for the renovation of the former Masonic Temple, which is part of the Montgomery Street/Columbus Circle Historic District. He explained that the previous owner had repurposed the property for residential living. The new owners are renovating the interior and completing some minor repairs and alterations to the exterior. Exterior alterations and repairs include replacing the solid metal, recessed tenant door with an aluminum-framed glass door; repair and painting of all wood trim (black); and repair and maintenance of the wood windows on the front façade. On the north façade, the application calls for the creation of several new window openings. The new windows will be aluminum-clad wood. J. Sisko noted that they are applying for the Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credits for the project and they had received approval of the Part 2 from the National Park Service. After discussion, the Board agreed to approve the application as submitted.

PR-18-27-M1 411 Colvin St (St. Anthony of Padua). Matthew Lupiani (SWBR) presented the modifications to the design of the adaptive reuse of the former St. Anthony's School and Convent into senior apartments. The Board reviewed the revised drawings and agreed to recommend approval of the proposed modifications. However, in discussion, Board members observed that it appeared there is the potential for water and snow to get trapped at the connection between the 3-story addition and the gable roof dormer on the east elevation of the convent, which the Board suggested the designers address, as necessary. In addition, it was suggested that the applicant could consider rearranging the windows and brick infill panels on the north elevation of the addition above the entrance. The Board suggested that paired windows be located in the bays above the doorway on the second and third floors and that the brick infill panels be located to the left of the paired windows. Although the Board noted that this might not be possible based on the interior layout of the addition, it noted that the location of the paired windows as suggested would be more in keeping with the character of the historic building.

### **DISCUSSION**

Local Protected Site Nomination update: 429 N. State Street. K. Auwaerter reported that the Common Council had held the designation of 429 N. State Street until the November 18, 2019 meeting date in order to give the property owner an opportunity to speak to the Council, which he will do at the November 13, 2019 study session. K. Auwaerter stated that she would be in attendance at the meeting. B. Haley noted that it was important for the Council to understand that the vote was about the designation and not about the future development of the building or surrounding sites.

National Register Nomination: Merrell-Soule None Such Mince Meat Factory. The Board discussed the nomination for the former mincemeat and powdered milk canning factory. The Board discussed how the architectural integrity of industrial buildings is evaluated for the National Register, especially those with multiple additions that have been added over decades to accommodate growth, new uses and/or changes in technology. After discussion, the Board concurred that the property was eligible for the State and National Registers of Historic Places.

National Association of Preservation Commission Workshop (8/23/19). K. Auwaerter noted that she and several Board members (D. Radke, B. Haley, J. Marshall and J. Romano) had attended the NAPC workshop that was held on August 23, 2019 in City Hall Atrium. The attendees agreed that it had been an interesting and informative workshop. In particular, they found the legal and board procedure discussions to be particularly

informative. K. Auwaerter noted that one of the primary takeaways was that the city's preservation program would benefit from developing a strategy and plan for more consistent communications with the Mayor's Office, Common Council and with the public.

**ADJOURN**

The meeting was adjourned at 9:40 AM.